



## CEU Summer University

Zrínyi u. 14, Budapest, Hungary 1051

Tel.: (36 1) 327 3069, 327 3811

Fax: (36 1) 327 3124

E-mail: [summeru@ceu.hu](mailto:summeru@ceu.hu)

Website: <http://www.ceu.hu/sun/index.html>

### *Transnational Flows, Structures, Agents, and the Idea of Development*

July 5-16, 2004

- Course Directors: **Judit Bodnár**, Central European University, Dept. of History /Sociology, Budapest  
**Ayse Çağlar**, Central European University, Dept. of Sociology and Anthropology, Budapest  
**Shalini Randeria**, University of Zurich, Dept. of Anthropology
- Resource Persons: **Kaveh Ehsani**, Jomhur Social Research Association and *Goft-o-Gu* Quarterly, Teheran and Chicago  
**Jok Madut Jok**, Loyola Marymount, Los Angeles, Department of History  
**Ivan Krastev**, Centre for Liberal Strategies, Sofia  
**Norma Moruzzi**, University of Illinois at Chicago, Dept. of Political Science  
**Vinh-Kim Nguyen**, McGill University, Dept. of Social Studies of Medicine, Montreal  
**John Ryle**, Rift Valley Institute and TLS, London  
**Peter Stamatov**, Yale University, Dept. of Sociology, New Haven

#### **Description**

Globalization has superseded development, authors of globalization claim almost consensually. Major points of criticism are directed in general against the poverty of developmentalist imagination: the cultural insensitivity of development theories, their homogenization and essentialization of the part of the world that is in need of development, the unilinear and teleological foundations of developmental thinking, and the instrumental role of the (nation) state in the process. Opinions may diverge concerning the first two points but most experts concur that globalization has eroded this latter potential of the state. While we agree with the representatives of globalization discourse who see development theory as a totalizing paradigm, instead of “posting” development this course will make an attempt to bring the two into dialogue with each other. The examination of the reconfigured (nation) state and the idea of public good we believe are the key to this endeavor.

The course is not an exercise in defining and mapping globalization. The topic is vast and much has been written on it. The course will examine some strategic sites and structures that condition transnational flows of commodities, labor and ideas with a keen eye on the intricate role of the state and the idea of public good. In selecting the topics, we made a concentrated effort to bring theory and empirical work together. We invited both academics and professionals, practitioners who reflect on their own praxis, or let others do it and are willing to engage in a dialogue. While doing so the course also aims to disperse common misconceptions about globalization such as

- the dichotomy of inside and outside, and consequently, that being part of global capitalism is much better than being left out;
- the dichotomy of local and global, of fragmentation and globalization;
- the diminishing significance of place;

- and most importantly, the withering-away of the state.

Following a brief exposition of the history of development-thinking that has had a powerful influence on transformations in the broadly understood non-Western world, the uneasy relationship between development and globalization is spelled out. The course then examines the origins of the concern for the distant other, the history of humanitarian aid and the beginnings of transnational civil society in order to place arguments concerning globalization in a historical and theoretical perspective. The unfolding of the globalization question proceeds through some strategic encounters of transnational flows, structures and agents among which private capital, NGOs, supranational organizations and states figure prominently.

One such privileged site is transnational humanitarian aid whose current role is scrutinized in a historical perspective from both the donor's and the recipient's side. Transnational migration is a well-researched theme but we take an underemphasized aspect, its interaction with the state.

In the globalization literature the field of law has been rather marginal and the literature of legal globalization builds primarily on the experience of western societies. The section on the transnationalization of law corrects this imbalance. By situating the contemporary processes of transnationalization of law and the emerging landscapes of interlegality in the context of a long history of colonial designs and desires, the section exposes post-colonial continuities and discontinuities of legal modernization and the instrumental role of the state in the regulation of 'development.' A strategic site of intervention is the transnational circulation of anti-retroviral drugs in developing countries, which mobilizes pharmaceutical capital, states and transnational therapeutic concern that all figure in the emergence of a new biopolitics.

Corruption has become a major social problem worldwide and the anticorruption struggle a major preoccupation of international organizations and nation-states. The anticorruption struggle that constitutes an important public good captures an unusually forceful presence of the state, hence its special importance for our topic.

The idea of freedom constitutes a public good and a developmental asset. It is formed in the intertwining of local and global forces that shape modern political structures and identities. The course analyzes two instances of the transnationalization of civil society around the theme of freedom: the constraining and liberating aspects of the universalism of human rights discourse and the women's movement.

The course is organized in a spiral manner; the final section revisits the fundamental assumptions of development theory, its critics, and their critics. By drawing on previous examples of the interaction of supranational organizations, NGOs, private capital and the state in promoting private and public good, the final phase attempts to bring together globalization and development discourse, and invite the participants to a lively and informed discussion about the meaning and possibilities of development in the age of globalization.

### **Purpose**

This is a course for practitioners and theoreticians, and is particularly designed to bring the two together on a topic that many consider of utmost importance but some dismiss for lack of theoretical sophistication. The aim is to scrutinize the interaction of research, policy as well as social theory. Due to its multiple geographical foci and the diversity of resource people, the course is well suited to offer a challenging perspective to students from both the region and outside.

Beyond regular class discussions, we plan to organize a public event during the time of the course: a **public debate** on the course topic with the involvement of some of the resource persons as well as other relevant CEU faculty, and long-time practitioners of development consulting.

### **Topics**

1. Development in the age of globalization—introducing the problem (Judith Bodnar)

2. The Origins of Moral Globalization: Long-distance Care and Evangelicalism (Peter Stamatov)
3. Transnationalization of corruption and the globalization of (anti)corruption discourse (Ivan Krastev)
4. Encountering the states in transnational migration (Ayşe Çağlar)
5. The cunning state and the transnationalization of law (Shalini Randeria)
6. Transnational biopolitics, subjectivity, development and the humanitarian industry (Vinh-Kim Nguyen)
  - a. Politics, bodies, and desire.  
What is the social impact and local politics of transnational networks of NGOs, discourses, and Bretton Woods institutions?
  - b. Circulation, subjectification, publics  
How do these networks work?
  - c. Biopower, multitude, sovereignty.  
How can we theorize these networks?
7. Humanitarian aid as development: the globalization of the welfare system (Jok Madut Jok)
8. Towards a transnational civil society: human rights and religion (John Ryle)
9. Towards a transnational civil society: global feminism, local identities and modern Muslim women (Norma Moruzzi)
10. Becoming all alike? Catching up, the idea of development, post-development, and their critics (Kaveh Ehsani)
  - a. The Regimes of Development, Globalization, and Post-Washington Consensus: Market versus Plan, Market versus State as New Paradigm?
  - b. Defining Poverty as a 'Problem'
  - c. The Power Relationship at the Core of Development Discourse and Practice: Questioning the Economy and Technopolitics

For more detailed biographies, updated course description, syllabus, reading lists please check <http://www.ceu.hu/sun/index.html>

***Non-discrimination policy statement***

*Central European University does not discriminate on the basis of – including, but not limited to – race, color, national and ethnic origin, religion, gender or sexual orientation in administering its educational policies, admissions policies, scholarship and loan programs, and athletic and other school-administered programs.*