

***Polemos/Pulmus:
Ways of Confrontation in Judaism, Paganism, and Christianity in Late
Antiquity***

**Central European University, Budapest
9-20 July, 2012**

Syllabus

Monday, 9 July

10:50 -12:20

1. Stroumsa (1)

Christians, Jews and Pagans: a Fateful Triangle

Points of contact and points of debate; their common heritage; reasons why they are best treated in a comparative way.

- Fredriksen P. *Augustine and the Jews: A Christian Defense of Jews and Judaism*. New Haven, 2008, 41-102.
- Rokeah, D. *Jews, Pagans and Christians in Conflict*. Jerusalem - Leiden: Magnes Press - Brill, 1982, 40-83.
- Stroumsa, G. G. "Celsus, Origen, and the Nature of Religion." In Perrone, L. (ed.), *Discorsi di verita: paganesimo, giudaismo e cristianesimo a confronto nel "Contro Celso" di Origene*. Rome: Institutum Patristicum Augustinianum, 1998, 81-95.

13:40-15:10

2. Dillon (1)

Philo and the Origins of Philosophy

Attitudes to Greek philosophy in Hellenistic Judaism

- Philo of Alexandria. "*On the Creation of the World (De opificio mundi)*" (ed. L. Cohn and P. Wendland), transl. F. H. Colson and G. H. Whitaker. In *Philo*, vol. I, Cambridge, Mass. – London: Harvard University Press, 1929 (Loeb Classical Library 226), §§ 1-130 (6-102).
 - Philo of Alexandria. *On the Creation of the Cosmos According to Moses*. Introd., transl. and comm. D. T. Runia, Leiden etc.: Brill, 2001, pp. 47-80.
 - Dillon, J. M. "Cosmic Gods and Primordial Chaos in Hellenistic and Roman Philosophy: The Context of Philo's Interpretation of Plato's *Timaeus* and the Book of Genesis." In G. van Kooten (ed.) *The Creator of Heaven and Earth: Reinterpretations of Genesis 1*, Leiden: Brill, 98-107.
- OR**
- Dillon, J. M. "Reclaiming the Heritage of Moses: Philo's Confrontation with Greek Philosophy." *Studia Philonica* 7 (1995):108–123.

15:30-17:00

3. Cohen (1)

Politics

The Jews and Empire: revolution and quietism; rabbinic attitudes to revolutionaries (Zealots, Bar Kokhba) and collaborators (R. Yohanan ben Zakkai; R. Eleazar b. R. Shimon)

- Mireille, Hadas-Lebel. *Jerusalem against Rome*. Leuven: Peeters Publishers. 2006, 127-193.

Tuesday, 10 July

9:00-10:30

1. Geréby (1)

Political Theology I: Hellenistic

Cosmic legitimation; the Empire: analogies of the realms; "Pythagorean" treatises: pax deorum and pax Romana; the Emperor as the analogon of god; peace: ara pacis and Janus; ideologues of the Empire: Pseudo-Aristotle, Celsus, Dio Chrysostom, Maximus of Tyrus, Sallustius

Mandatory readings:

Source:

- Polybius. *Histories VI*; Dio Chrysostom, *First Discourse on Kingship*; Pseudo-Aristotle, *On the World* 396b23 sq.

Secondary Literature:

- Brunt, P. A. "Princeps a diis electus: The Divine Election of the Emperor as a Political Concept at Rome by Rufus Fears." *JRS* 69 (1979): 168-175.
- Momigliano, A. "The Disadvantages of Monotheism for a Universal State." In: *On Pagans, Jews and Christians*, Middletown (Conn.): Wesleyan UP, 1987, 142-158.

Optional Secondary Literature:

- O' Meara D. J. *Platonopolis: Platonic Political Philosophy in Late Antiquity*. Oxford: Clarendon, 2003. 73-132.
- Goodenough, E. R. "The Political Philosophy of Hellenistic Kingship." *Yale Classical Studies* 1(1928): 58-102.

10:50-12:20

2. Boyarin (1)

The Pharisees against Moses: Jesus' Defense of the Halakha in Mark 7

Rabbinic dietary and purity-laws in the Gospels - who cares? different attitudes of the Gospels to Jewish law; engaging the problem of "Jewish-Christianity"

- Furstenberg, Y. "Defilement Penetrating the Body: a New Understanding of Contamination in Mark 7.15." *New Testament Studies* 54 (2008):176-200.

13:40-15:10

3. Stroumsa (2)

False Prophets of Early Christianity: Heresies and Polemics

Christianity emerged as an array of theologies: from the earliest moments teachers like Simon Magus wanted to shape the new theological teaching according to their own tastes. The Great Church tradition evolved through a thicket of rival Christian schools and sects, summarily called the Gnostics. In what did these teachings differ from the mainstream, and what strategies did the Great Church deploy to emerge from these debates?

- Stroumsa, G. G. "False Prophet, False Messiah and the Religious Scene in Seventh-Century Jerusalem." In Paget, J. C.-Bockmuehl, M. (eds.). *Redemption and Resistance: The Messianic Hopes of Jews and Christians in Antiquity*, Edinburgh: T & T Clark, 2007, 285-296.

- Macrae, G. "Why did the Church reject Gnosticism?" In E.P. Sanders (ed). *Jewish and Christian Self-Definition*, 1. London: SCM Press, 1980, 126-133.

Wednesday, 11 July

9:00-10:30

1. Stroumsa (3)

Christian Polemics against Jews and Muslims: a Comparison

For Christians, Jews were the „stubborn“ representatives of the Old Covenant. The early reactions to Muslims was that of a radical Arian Christian sect (John of Damascus). The arguments against “Old Israel” were therefore different from the arguments against “heretics“

- Stroumsa, G.G. "From Anti-Judaism to Antisemitism in Early Christianity?" In Limor, O. and Stroumsa, G. (eds.), *Contra Judaeos: Ancient and Medieval Polemics between Christians and Jews*, Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1995, 1-26.

- Schaefer, P. *The Jewish Jesus*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012, 1-67.

- Schaefer, P. *Jesus in the Talmud*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007, 95-129.

10:50-12:20

2. Turán (1)

Facets of God: Polymorphous Imagery in Ancient Rabbinic Theology

the 'multifaceted God' and polymorphous sculpture – theological accommodation?; visual vs. auditive imagery; some hermeneutical problems: divine visibility and God-talk; Ezekiel's tetramorph, the patriarchs and the evangelists

Sources:

- Pesiqta de-Rav Kahana 12.24-25; Pesiqta Rabbati 21; Esther rabbah 6.9; bSanhedrin 103b; Gen. rabbah 47.6; Pliny, Nat. hist. XXXV 37 (120); Lucian, *On the Syrian Goddess* (ed., tr., comm. J. L. Lightfoot), Oxford 2003, 270f (&445f); Jerome, Letters LIII.8(9).

Secondary literature:

- Boyarin, D. "The Eye in the Torah: Ocular Desire in Midrashic Hermeneutic." *Critical Inquiry* 16 (1990): 532-550.

- Friedman, Sh. J. "Anthropomorphism and Its Eradication." In Asselt, W. van et al. (eds.), *Iconoclasm and Iconoclasm: Struggle for Religious Identity*. Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007, 157-178.

- Petuchowski, Jacob. *Theology and Poetry; Studies in the Medieval Piyyut*. London, etc., 1978, 31-38.

13:40-15:10

3. Buzási (1)

Tempted by the Sun: Solar Theology in Late Antiquity

The development of a heliocentric theology in Late Antiquity; its articulation and culmination in Pagan Neoplatonism, especially in the works of the Emperor Julian and Proclus; the polemical character of Pagan solar theology and the Christian response to it

- Julian. *Hymn to King Helios*. In *Julian I*, ed. and transl. by W. C. Wright, Cambridge, Mass. – London: Harvard University Press, 1913 (Loeb Classical Library 13): 352-435.

- Dillon, J. M. “The Theology of Julian’s *Hymn to King Helios*.” *Itaca* 14-15 (1998/99) 103-115.

- Opsomer, J. “Weshalb nach Julian die mosaisch-christliche Schöpfungslehre der platonischen Demiurgie unterlegen ist.” In Ch. Schäfer (ed.), *Kaiser Julian ‘Apostata’ und die philosophische Reaktion gegen das Christentum*, Berlin-New York: De Gruyter, 2008, 127-156.

Thursday, 12 July

9:00-10:30

1. Boyarin (2)

The Invention of Judaism

This lecture will focus primarily on the Letters of Ignatius, Bishop of Antioch. This first-century Christian author first polemically uses the term Ioudaismos to mean something like the religion of the Jews, but it is, nonetheless, in a surprising fashion. The meaning of threskeia and the (Christian) invention of religion.

Source:

-The Letters of Ignatius:
to Ephesians
to Magnesians
to Philadelphians

Optional Secondary Literature:

- Boyarin, D. *Border Lines: The Partition of Judaeo-Christianity*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004.

- Goodman, M. “The Function of Minim in Early Rabbinic Judaism.” In *Geschichte – Tradition – Reflexion*, Festschrift Martin Hengel. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1996, vol. 1, 501-510.

- Kalmin, L. R. “Christians and Heretics in Rabbinic Literature of Late Antiquity.” *HTR* 87 (1994):155-169.

- Kimelman, R. “Birkat Ha-Minim and the Lack of Evidence for an Anti-Christian Jewish Prayer in Late Antiquity.” In Sanders, E. P. Baumgarten, A.L.

- Mendelsohn, A (eds). *Jewish and Christian Self-Definition*, vol. 2: Aspects of Judaism in the Graeco-Roman Period, Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981, 226-244.

- Thornston, T.C.G. “Christian Understandings of the Birkath Ha-Minim in The Eastern Roman Empire.” *Journal of Theological Studies* 38 (1987):419-431.

10:50-12:20

2. Cohen (2)

Gentile Idolatry and Jewish Martyrdom; the Limits of Collaboration

Mishnah Avodah Zarah 1-3: the major themes and concerns of the tractate

Mandatory Readings:

- Stern, Sacha. *Jewish Identity in early Rabbinic Writings*. Leiden: Brill 139-170.

Optional Readings:

- Herr D.Moshe. "Persecutions and Martyrdom in Hadrian's Days." *Scripta Hierosolymitana* 23 (1972):85-126, *Studies in History*, 85-125 (we are interested in part II- 102-123; skim the rest).

13:40-15:10

3. Stroumsa (4)

Who is Abraham's Heir?

The claims of the three Abrahamic religions (Judaism, Christianity and Islam) to be the true heir of Abraham; the idea of election; arguments supporting one's election and against the legitimacy of the other; what is the status of Abraham's other heirs?

-Stroumsa, G.G. "Religious Dynamics between Christians and Jews in Late Antiquity" In Casiday, A. M. – Norris, F. (eds.), *Cambridge History of Christianity, 300-600*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007, 151-172.

- Remi Brague, "On 'the Three Monotheisms.'" Forthcoming.

Friday, 13 July

9:00-10:30

1. Geréby (2)

Political Theology II: Hellenistic Jewish Political Theology

Anti-imperial theories in a Hellenistic garb: against Pseudo-Aristotle; the origins and functions of kingship; a new political form: theocracy (Josephus); political consequences of the New Testament

Mandatory readings:

Source:

- Philo. *On the creation of the world* ch. 1; Josephus, *Against Apion* 2:111; Bible 1Samuel 8-16; Isaiah 11; Ep. to the Romans; Galatians.

Secondary literature:

- Aune, D. "The influence of Roman Imperial Court Ceremonial on the Apocalypse of John." *Papers of the Chicago Society of Biblical Research* 28 (1985):5–26.

Optional Secondary Literature:

- Goodenough, E.R. *The Politics of Philo Judaeus: Practice and Theory*. New Haven: Yale UP, 1938 (repr. Hildesheim: Olms, 1967). 86-120

10:50-12:20

2. Dillon (2)

Origen against Celsus

The Church Father's refutation of the attacks on Christianity by the Pagan Platonist

- Origen, *Contra Celsum*, transl., introd. & notes by H. Chadwick, Cambridge (UK): Cambridge University Press, 1953 (repr. with corrections, 1965), Book I, 7-65.

- Frede, M. "Celsus' Attack on the Christians." In Barnes, J. – Griffin, M. (ed.). *Philosophia Togata 2, Plato and Aristotle at Rome*, Oxford: Clarendon, 1997, 218-240.

13:40-15:10

3. Turán (2)

Oikoumene and Oylem: Spheres of the Rabbinic Universe

Rabbinic proxemics: 'rules of engagement' with various groups of non-rabbis as reflected by Talmudic law and exegesis; the socio-geography of social responsibility ('love' and reproach, charity, punishment, etc.): neighbors and fellows, city, country and 'world'; corporate identities.

Sources:

- Luke 10.25-37; mTaanit 1.5-6, 2.5-6, 3.3-5, 4.6-7; tSotah 7.2-6; Sifra, *Kedoshim, pereq* 4; Avot de-Rabbi Nathan (version A), ch. 16; bShabbat 54b-55a; bShevuot 39a-b; Sifre Deut. ch. 116; mKiddushin 1.10; bPesahim 94a; Mekhilta de-Rabbi Shimon bar Yohai 19.6

Secondary literature

- Pedersen, Johannes. *Israel, Its Life and Culture*, I-II. Copenhagen 1926, 54-60;

- Kaminsky, Joel S. *Corporate Responsibility in the Hebrew Bible*. Sheffield, 1995, 16-29.

Monday, 16 July

9:00-10:30

1. Edwards (1)

The Toleration of Difference in Early Christianity

(Building on the significance of early heresiology.) How did orthodoxy begin? How was unity achieved in the huge expanse of the Church? To what extent did the development of dogma limit theological development?

- Ling, Karen. "Which Early Christianity?" In Harvey, S.A-Hunter, D.G (eds.). *The Oxford Handbook of Early Christian Studies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008, 66-86.

10:50-12:20

2. Boyarin (3)

The Conversion of the Jews

Christian narratives of Jewish Conversion in Late Antiquity; the Conversion of the Jews of Minorca, the conversion of Count Joseph in Eusebius; the shift in Roman discourse from forbidding circumcision to forbidding conversion; the Invention of Religion. Polemical conspiracies between the Fathers and the Rabbis to produce Christianity and Judaism: Jerome and the Blessing of the Christians.

- Bradbury, Scott. "Introduction." *Severus of Minorca: Letter on the Conversion of the Jews*. Trans. and Ed. Scott Bradbury. Oxford Early Christian Texts. Oxford: Clarendon-Oxford UP, 1996.
- Brown, Peter. "The Cult of the Saints: Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity." In *The Haskell Lectures on History of Religions* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1981), 105.
- Thornton T.C.G. "The Stories of Joseph of Tiberias," *Vigiliae Christianae* 44 (1990): 54–63.

13:40-15:10

3. Dillon (3)

Porphyry against the Christians

The attack of the Neoplatonist Philosopher on the Christians

- *Porphyry against the Christians*, introd., transl. and notes by BERCHMAN, R. M., Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2005.
- Edwards, M. "Porphyry and the Christians." In Karamanolis, G. – SHEPPARD, A. (eds.), *Studies on Porphyry*, London, 2007.

Tuesday, 17 July

9:00-10:30

1. Edwards (2)

The Definition of a Scriptural Canon within the Church

The development of the Christian canon; debates around the acceptance / rejection of individual writings and even the Old Testament as a whole (Marcionism); theological and political implications of the debates

- Young, F. M. *Biblical Exegesis and the Formation of Christian Culture*. Cambridge–New York: Cambridge UP, 1997, 9-28; 97-116.

10:50-12:20
2. Boyarin (4)

Jesus in the Talmud

A polemical lecture defending (against Peter Schäfer) the connections between “The One Like a Son of Man” in Daniel 7, the “Son of Man” of the Gospels, and the late-ancient Enoch/Metatron traditions in the Babylonian Talmud and the Hekhalot (so-called 3 Enoch). The inner-talmudic polemic against binitarianism. Polemical conspiracies between the Fathers and the Rabbis to produce Christianity and Judaism.

- Schafer, P. *Jesus in the Talmud*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 2007, 68-149.

13:40-15:10
4. Cohen (3)

Culture

Greek wisdom: how much Hellenism in rabbinic Palaestina and Babylonia?

Mandatory readings

- Lieberman, Saul. “How Much Greek in Jewish Palestine?” reprinted in Henry Fischel, *Essays in Greco-Roman and Related Talmudic Literature* (1977) no. 18. 325-343.
- Cohen, Shaye J.D. “Patriarchs and Scholarchs,” reprinted in his *The Significance of Yavneh and Other Essays in Jewish Hellenism* (2010) 71-92.

Optional

- Cohen, Shaye J.D. “The Name of the Ruse: The Toss of a Ring to Save Life and Honor.” In *Follow the Wise: Studies in Jewish History and Culture in Honor of Lee Levine*, ed. Zeev Weiss et al. (Eisenbrauns 2010) 25-36.

Wednesday, 18 July

9:00-10:30
1. Buzási (2)

Julian against “the Galileans”

The arguments of the “Apostate” against Christianity and the counterarguments of the Patriarch of Alexandria: the context of the debate, methods of argumentation and interpretation

- Julian. “*Against the Galilaeans*.” In *Julian III*, ed. (based on Neumann’s edition) and transl. by W. C. Wright, Harvard University Press, 1923 (Loeb Classical Library 157), 318-426.
- Hoffmann, J. *Julian’s Against the Galilaeans*, Amherst: Prometheus, 2004.
- Riedweg, Chr., “With Stoicism and Platonism against the Christians: Structures of Philosophical Argumentation in Julian’s «*Contra Galilaeos*».” *Hermathena* 166 (1999) 63-91.

10:50-12:20

2. Edwards (3)

The Impact of Apologetic on Christian Insiders

Christianity emerged from its earliest period as an array of rival movements. This period seemed to lack central decision making bodies for the Church. The anti-heretical treatises were the form of defining the broadest minima for “orthodoxy”

- Bauer, W. *Orthodoxy and Heresy in Earliest Christianity*. Mifflintown (PA): Sigler, 1996 (originally publ. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1971, 1-60).
- Boys-Stones, G. R. *Post-Hellenistic Philosophy: A Study of its Development from the Stoics to Origen*. Oxford – New York: Oxford UP, 2001, 151-202.

13:40-15:10

3. Dillon (4)

Aeneas of Gaza and the Platonic School of his Day

The criticism of Pagan Platonic doctrines by a Neoplatonist Convert to Christianity

- Aeneas of Gaza, *Theophrastus sive de immortalitate animae*, ed. COLONNA, M. E., Napoli: Iodice, 1958, transl. John Dillon, manuscript.
- Watts, E. “An Alexandrian Christian Response to Fifth-Century Neoplatonic Influence.” In Smith, A. (ed.), *The Philosopher and Society in Late Antiquity: Essays in Honour of Peter Brown*. Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2005, 215-229.

Thursday, 19 July

9:00-10:30

1. Cohen (4)

Rabbinic Universalism

Converts to Judaism, ger toshav, “God-Fearers,” “the seven laws for the children of Noah

Mandatory readings

- Cohen, Shaye J.D. “Crossing the Boundary and Becoming a Jew.” In *The Beginnings of Jewishness*. Berkeley: University of California Pres, 1999, 140-174.
- Robert Goldenberg. “The Rabbinic Accommodation.” In *The Nations that know Thee not*. New York: University of New York Pres, 1998, 81-98.

Optional readings

- David Novak. *The Image of the Non-Jew in Judaism*. Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 1983, 3-6 (sections 1-2), 14-35 (sections 6-8).

10:50-12:20

2. Edwards (4)

The Christian Appropriation of the Name Israel

The notion of “true Israel“ in the Bible and in Early Judaism; the New Testament and the earliest Christians on election and rejection; the development of supersessionism (replacement theology) in Early Christianity.

- Simon. M. *Verus Israel: A Study of the Relations between Christians and Jews in the Roman Empire (AD 135-425)*, translated from the French by H. McKeating, London –Portland (Or.): Vallentine Mitchell, 1996, 3-132.
- Lieu, J.M. *Image and Reality: the Jews in the World of the Christians in the Second Century*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1996, 277-290.

13:40:15:10

3. Buzási (3)

Julian’s Project to Rebuild the Temple in Jerusalem

The political and theological motivations of the Pagan Emperor, and the Christian and Jewish reactions to his plan

- Levenson, D. “The Ancient and Medieval Sources for the Emperor Julian’s Attempt to rebuild the Jerusalem Temple.” *Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic and Roman Period* 35 (2004): 409-460.
- Millar, Fergus G. B. “Rebuilding the Jerusalem Temple: pagan, Jewish and Christian conceptions.” *Вестник древней истории (Journal of Ancient History)* 1 (2008):19-37.

Friday, 20 July

10:50-12:20

2. Turán (3)

“Seventy Nations, Seventy Angels“ – A Rabbinic Concept of World History

horizontal vs. vertical concepts of ‘the nations’; ‘seventy authentic nations’ and their guardian angels; peace and war, celestial and earthly; ‘Exoduses’ and the Exodus; seventy nations’ and biblical-prophetic eschatology

Sources:

- Deut. 32.8-9; Amos 3.1-2, 9.7; Zech. 14.9, 16ff; Lev. rabbah 2.4; Tanhuma, *Vayyiqra* 8; Pesiqta de-Rav Kahana 28; Mekhilta, *Shirta, Beshallah* 2; bAvoda zara 2a-b; bSukkah 55b

Secondary Literature:

- Flusser, D. “Not by an Angel!...”, In idem, *Judaism of the Second Temple Period*, vol. 1, Grand Rapids, etc. - Jerusalem, 2007, 61-65.
- Mach, M., *Entwicklungsstadien des jüdischen Engelglaubens in vorrabbinischer Zeit*, Tübingen, 1992, 257-262.

13:40-15:10

3. Geréby (3)

Political Theology III: Christian Views on the Empire and Universal Peace

The church as nation; the angels of the nations; secular time and salvation history; the conversion of the nations: imperial or anti-imperial politics? Paul, Origen, and Gregory of Nazianzus, Theological orations (selections); the Christian Emperor

Mandatory readings:

Source:

- Eusebius of Caesaria, *Life of Constantine*.
- Augustine. *The City of God*, VI – VII.
- Gregory of Nazianzus: Third Theological Oration (Oration 29).

Secondary Literature:

- Hollerich, M.J. "Religion and politics in the writings of Eusebius: Reassessing the First Court Theologian." *Church History* 59 (1990): 309–25.

Optional Secondary Literature:

- Cranz, F.E. "Kingdom and Polity in Eusebius of Caesarea", *Harvard Theological Review* 45 (1952), 47-56.
- Murray, R. *Symbols of Church and Kingdom: A Study in Early Syriac Tradition*. Revised edition, London – New York: T&T Clark, 1977, 41-94.
- Rapp, C. "Imperial Ideology in the Making: Eusebius of Caesarea on Constantine as "Bishop'." *Journal of Theological Studies* 49 (1998):685–95.

4. Course Directors: 15:30-16:00

Concluding Remarks