

New Frontiers in Romani Studies: Insights from Critical Race Theory

Instructors

Angéla Kóczé, (koczea@ceu.edu), Central European University
Eddie Bruce-Jones (e.bruce-jones@bbk.ac.uk), Birkbeck College, University of London
Tommaso Vitale (tommaso.vitale@sciencespo.fr), Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Paris
Faye Venetia Harrison (fvharrsn@illinois.edu) University of Illinois
Margareta Matache (mmatache@hsph.harvard.edu), Harvard University
Colin Clark (Colin.Clark@uws.ac.uk), University of West Scotland
Matthias Möschel (MoschelM@ceu.edu), Central European University
Cengiz Barskanmaz (barskanmaz@eth.mpg.de), Max Planck Institute Social Anthropology
Márton Rövid (rovidm@ceu.edu), Central European University

Course description

This summer course offers a pioneering intellectual inquiry into the dynamics, varieties, and antagonisms of racialization and racial oppression of Romani people in relation to other racialized populations in Europe. “Racialization and racial oppression of Roma are discursive and structural mechanisms that place them in an imaginary hierarchical classificatory system based on phenotypical, cultural, and social markers and render them as “other”/sub-human. These oppressive discourses became articulated and solidified in concrete social practices, mechanisms, policies, and structures in Roma people’s everyday lives” (Kóczé 2020).

The course examines the links between gender, race, and class in the past and present era of global capitalism and the impact of marketization, financialization on racialized groups. Through the course participants will critically explore the historical formation of intersected racialized and gendered manifestations of oppression at the global and local level. The course explores how dominant social and political rationalities through histories have constructed and effected various racialized groups. During the course participants will explore the dynamics of global racial inequality and process of social change through a variety of topics, such as gendered division of labor, politics of bodies, politics of (re)production and politics of surplus populations.

The summer school addresses the following questions: What are the insights and limitations of applying critical race theory to the studying the situation of Roma in Eastern European societies? What are the manifestations and patterns of anti-Romani racisms? How is it reproduced in different areas of public life? How could enduring forms of racial injustice be tackled?

The summer course aims to provide participants with theoretical, methodological and analytical tools to understand the position of Roma in Europe historically and in the present moment and to contribute to the promotion of social justice and social change in our society. The program will equip participants with the knowledge, skills and values to understand issues faced by racialized Roma, to analyze these issues through lenses of critical social theories and to comprehend the multiple dimensions of Roma’s exclusion and marginalization in Europe and elsewhere.

Learning outcomes

The course is designed to develop participants' knowledge of Roma history of marginalization and racialization, policies of exclusion and inclusion, and relevant concepts and theories in order to achieve the following learning outcomes. By the end of the course, participants should be able to

- form theoretically and historically grounded understanding of the main ways in which race and racism operates in Eastern Europe and beyond
- reflect upon the ingrained features of racism that characterize and structure our societies by analyzing the experiences of Roma in various historical period
- able to critically analyze legal measures and policies towards Roma and other ethnic groups, including models to manage ethnic diversity
- identify and analyze forms of everyday anti-Gypsyism/ anti-Romani racism

Assessment

Each participant is assessed through a combination of the following:

1. Active participation: Participants are required to participate in all classes, read all mandatory texts prior to the classes, and actively contribute to class discussions. Please arrive to every class on time.
2. Draft paper: Each participant submits a draft paper of circa 1000-2000-words. The paper should be on the current (research) interest of the participant and relate to one of the topics discussed during the course.
3. Class presentation: Each participant presents her draft paper. A selected faculty member provides feedback on the paper to be followed by constructive comments by all participants.

Equality, diversity, engagement

The summer course targets MA and PhD students. Romani students are particularly encouraged to apply. The course pays particular attention to the gender and ethnic diversity of its faculty and participants.

The course provides a unique platform for scholarly exchange and mutual learning for committed anti-racist scholars from the US and Europe. Going beyond academic debates, the course explicitly focuses on the challenges and dilemmas of anti-racist activist scholars. The course seeks to lay the foundations for a sustainable transatlantic network of critical anti-racist scholars.

Draft outline

28 June

Introduction (all faculty)

Faye Harrison: Critical Race Theory and Its Transdisciplinary Translations into Critical Race Analysis

Critical race theory (CRT) grew out of critical legal scholarship mainly in law schools. Besides influences from legal studies, however, the leading critical race theorists drew

on contributions from other fields and disciplines in which explorations and interrogations of race, race relations, racism, antiracism and their intersections with other sites of inequality, power, and social control have figured prominently. Insights from Black & Critical Ethnic Studies, sociology, literature (especially autobiography, memoir, & fiction), feminist scholarship, and anthropology have been integrated into the discourses and texts identified with critical race theory. CRT has, in turn, had an important impact on approaches to race within the social sciences and literary scholarship. These intermeshings, entanglements, and convergences lead me to think in more interdisciplinary terms about a broader corpus of parallel and convergent critical race analyses to which an array of fields have contributed.

Faye Harrison: Intersectionality in Historical, Methodological & Theoretical Perspectives

Intersectionality is an interpretive metaphor that critical race theory scholar Kimberle' Crenshaw coined in the late 1980s. The metaphor grew into a conceptual framework for investigating the interrelationships, interactions, and intermeshings among mutually constitutive dimensions of inequality and discrimination, such as those of race, gender, and citizenship status (citizen/immigrant). Crenshaw was not the first to illuminate the relationship between multiple axes and forms of oppression. Black feminist writers, among them Maria Stewart (1830s) and Anna Julia Cooper (1892) foreshadowing later contributions of Frances Beal, Deborah K. King, and Patricia Hill Collins, have sought to explain the compounded race/gender or race/gender/class phenomenon using concepts such as "double jeopardy," "multiple jeopardy," and "matrix of domination." Since Crenshaw's intervention, intersectionality has had considerable mobility in terms of its reach around the world. It has been widely appropriated in women's/gender/sexuality studies, sometimes with the effect of watering down its epistemic value as a tool for research design & practice, critical social analysis, and theory building. This lecture or seminar will examine the intellectual history and the most recent trends in research operationalization and critical social theory that seek to "sharpen intersectionality's critical edge" (Collins 2019).

29 June

Angéla Kóczé: Gender, Race, Class: Global Inequality and Structural Violence

This seminar revisits an assertion by critical scholars, such as that there is a political economy arising from contemporary practices of gendered and classed racialization as well as racial exclusion. The initial interest is to map these varied and often violent economic processes and connect to the theorization of "structural violence" as a concept coined by Johan Galtung peace scholar and educator. Galtung's work on structural violence remain relevant to overturn our conventional thinking on violence. This seminar aims to go beyond the visible account of violence and understand the mechanisms of "invisible" structural and cultural/epistemic violence. How does structural and cultural/epistemic violence relate to global inequality specifically to the gendered and racialization of Roma in Europe?

Angéla Kóczé: Commodification of Race and Gender

Nancy Leong (2013) defines Racial Capitalism as "the commodification of non-whites for social and economic gain," and "the process of getting some sort of social or

economic benefit from someone else's racial identity". Drawing from Leong critical intervention, this seminar employs the Marxian concept of "commodification" as a theoretical lens to discuss Racial capitalism in relation to racialized population such as Roma. In a capitalist framework, usually Roma are depicted as a marginalized and precarious surplus population who are oppressed and neglected than as a commodified population. In the course of the seminar, we interrogate how Roma are objectionably or unobjectionably commodified through historical episodes.

The Impact of #BlackLivesMatter on Roma Political Activism after COVID-19 (all faculty)

30 June

Mathias Möschel: The History and Philosophy of Race

Modern social scientists agree that race is not biological but a social, historical, cultural as well as legal construction. But how did such a construction take place? The idea of human races and their different values was created in a very specific context and reality which took its final shape and form during the Enlightenment period in Europe. This class will analyze how this occurred, as well as who contributed to modern race thought.

Mathias Möschel: Islamophobia

Arguably, of the various racisms existing in Europe and around the world (e.g., anti-Black racism, anti-Semitism, anti-gypsyism), anti-Muslim racism - sometimes also controversially referred to as Islamophobia - is the newest and (arguably) less historical form of racism. This class will discuss the similarities and differences in the patterns of exclusion and discrimination of Muslims in Europe as compared to other racialized minorities.

Cengiz Barskanmaz: Race as a legal concept

This seminar will identify, frame, and critically analyze contemporary national and European debates on race and law, providing both comparative and regional analysis. This is necessary, partly because in Europe, the terrain of thinking through ideas of race is contentious, locally specific, and ever-changing, as are legal provisions on racial discrimination. For instance, France, where it is generally illegal to collect racial statistics, took initiative to remove the term "race" from its constitution in 2018. In Germany too, the major political parties agreed on replacing "race" by "racist". Yet both countries remain bound to follow the racial discrimination provisions of the European Union and the United Nations.

1 July

Cengiz Barskanmaz: Racism against Jewish people

This seminar will discuss the historically grounded racism against Jews who have been defined as a racialized minority. They were considered as separate, inferior race, with a distinguishable identity, culture, religion justifying discrimination and even genocide. Antisemitism provides a unique case study through which to explore the dynamics between racialization, racial and religious discrimination. Also, it will reflect

upon how history has demonstrated, discrimination against Jewish people can manifest itself in different ways at different times.

Tommaso Vitale: Comparative studies on attitudes and stereotypes on Roma in Europe

The scientific literature on the dynamics of public opinion and racism as a whole has neglected the spread of anti-gypsy feeling. Only recently, with the Europeanization of the Roma Movements' claims, have official data from public opinion research made it possible to reach any empirically based conclusions on the spread of anti-gypsy prejudice in Europe. The availability of these data has not yet been fully exploited, and at the same time their use, albeit only partial, has not been critically worked out. On the other hand, we know that the use of opinion polls within the public sphere cannot be ignored, because of the resulting reification of the prejudice and the effects on the objectified ethnic category.

Tommaso Vitale: Beyond stereotypes, Romaphobia on the ground. Politics and policies in French, Italian & Spanish Cities

This seminar discusses how social innovation relates to the social production of space. Usually, the scholarly literature on local welfare, social work, and 'social cohesion' at the urban level mostly fails to consider the relevance of space. The spatial dimension of a socially creative strategy is constituted in physical and symbolic boundaries, in the built environment, in situated objects and relationships. Space can significantly contribute to stigma and exclusion, notably in segregated places. In fact, space performs: it has social effects on people's opportunities and on their self-esteem. Nonetheless the space is itself a social product; it is the object of strategies

2 July

Margareta Matache: History of Romani Studies

For many centuries, along with laws and policies, the Academy has been playing an important role in problematizing the Roma. In the past, Gypsy studies or Gypsyology helped build the concept, vocabulary and imagery of polarity between white Europeans and Roma. By categorizing Roma as an inferior and subordinate race, scholars fixed white cultural norms as the standard against which Roma were described. This discourse further helped shape a Euro-specific form of whiteness or what we could call gadjo-ness, itself built in opposition to Roma.

In contemporary academic literature, Romani people have become the subject of more rigorous research. Yet, to a large extent, gadjo-ness persists as the standard, and modern social science has not started to employ scholarly reflexivity in Romani studies. But in the past few decades, the emerging field of critical Romani studies has slowly begun to question the standard brand of Romani discourse, built, as it happens, on a foundation of difference, inferiority and subordination. In this session, we will discuss the field of Romani studies by looking at its history, influences, faces, and classifications.

Margareta Matache: Racist Thoughts, Race, and Racism: Theoretical Foundations and Roots

The concepts of race and racism have transformed and acquired different meanings in different historical, political, and geographical settings. Systems of oppression justified through cultural and race prejudice have been documented in different forms and times across the world, from Europe to Asia, the Arab region, Australia, or the Americas. And exodus and colonization involve migration, flow, and adjustment of ideas, attitudes, and practices across continents and countries, too. Thus, it is essential to also consider a global perspective in understanding and exploring different forms and manifestations of racism across centuries and territories. In this session, we aim to place the oppression and the racialization of Roma since the 1300s (and perhaps earlier) in the world's history of race and racism.

Social hour / visit to Romani NGO

5 July

Colin Clark: Roma Migration - Borders, Mobility, Settlement and Super-Diversity

This session will involve three key activities:

- 1) A brief presentation giving an overview of issues relating to borders, mobility, settlement and super-diversity as it applies within Romani Studies (case studies from across Europe).
- 2) A focused discussion based around the core readings selected to illustrate the main features of the issues being discussed (borders, mobility, settlement and super-diversity).
- 3) A critical co-produced writing-task based on the presentation, readings and class discussion. Further details to follow but this writing task will involve some pre-course preparation work whereby students will consider issues of Roma, Gypsy, Sinti, Traveler experiences of borders, mobility, settlement, and super-diversity in their own countries and/or where they currently stay.

Colin Clark: Research with Roma: Situational Ethics

In this workshop, we will explore, in an interactive manner, the nature, tensions and politics of 'situational ethics' when applied to research and scholarship in the broad field of Romani Studies. Following a brief outline from Colin Clark, covering some of the philosophical and practical aspects of why ethics matter in fieldwork and other personal and professional scenarios, the class will be divided into small groups and presented with a range of unique ethical vignettes/dilemmas to work through as a small group. You should try and reach consensus on what course of action you would take as a research team. For this class, students should read, as a minimum, the brief chapter by Saga Weckman ('Researching Finnish Gypsies: advice from a Gypsy').

Márton Rövid: White privilege and racial justice

The growing literature on racial justice in the field of normative political theory usually tracks the legacy of colonialism and imperialism, white settlement and African slavery, that systematically privileges 'whites' globally, and that needs to be 'repaired'. The moral grounding and forms of reparations are highly debated not only in academia but in countless political fora. However, both academic and political debates have largely taken place in post-colonial contexts and ignored the enduring forms of injustice Romani peoples face. In the seminar we are going to assess the relevance of normative

debates around racial justice for the case of Roma in two steps. First, arguments on the forms, desirability, and feasibility of reparations are reviewed. Some scholars distinguish remembrance, reconciliation, restorative justice, and reparations. The United Nations distinguishes five forms of reparations: restitution, compensation, rehabilitation, satisfaction, and guarantees of non-repetition. We discuss the relation between racial justice and democratic solidarity. Second, contemporary academic and political debates on anti-gypsyism are assessed in light of the literature on racial justice. To what extent and under what conditions can social and education policies remedy enduring racial injustice? What is the relation between social inclusion and tackling anti-gypsyism? Who and on what grounds can demand racial justice on behalf of Roma? Who have benefited from the exploitation of Roma and who bear responsibility for past and present forms of oppression? What are the responsibilities of so-called post-socialist states, churches, companies, settlements? To what extent is it desirable and feasible to tackle white privilege in Eastern Europe?

6 July

Márton Rövid: How to tackle enduring injustices?

This seminar is a follow-up to the class on white privilege and racial justice. Summer school participants in small groups discuss the main actors, key claims, achievements, and limitations of Romani claims for racial justice.

Eddie Bruce-Jones: Racism against Black people

This seminar examines the ways in which Black people have struggles against certain ideologies concerning racism, citizenship and belonging. It examines Blackness as an analytical category, investigates ways in which the concept of diaspora is employed in Black community.

Eddie Bruce-Jones: Critical Race Futures

This seminar will provide concluding remarks about further research and ongoing practical work on law in Europe. It will reflect on cutting-edge theoretical work that advances difficult debates on race and the law in Europe. These include consideration of work like Solanke's theory of discrimination as Stigma, Dembour's text on the human Rights of migrants, writings on critical race theory in Europe, particularly in the context of Gender, Intersectionality and Queer Studies.

7-8 July

Student presentations

9 July

Conclusions, next steps

Preliminary readings

Acton, Thomas A. „Scientific racism, popular racism and the discourse of the Gypsy Lore Society”, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 39:7, 2016, pp. 1187-1204.

Crenshaw, Kimberle “Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color.” *Stanford Law Review* 43, no. 6 (1991): 1241-1299.

Imre, Aniko “Whiteness in Post-Socialist Eastern Europe: The Time of the Gypsies, the End of Race.” *Post-Colonial Whiteness: A Critical Reader on Race and Empire*. ed. AJ Lopez. State University of New York Press, 2005.

Izsák, Rita. “The European Romani Women’s Movement: The Struggle for Human Rights.” *Development* 52 (2) 2009, pp. 200–207.

Kóczé, Angéla. (2020) Racialization, Racial Oppression of Roma. In: Ness I., Cope Z. (eds) *The Palgrave Encyclopedia of Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham, pp 124-131.

Lee, Ken. “Orientalism and Gypsylorism” *Social Analysis: The International Journal of Social and Cultural Practice*, vol. 44, no. 2, 2000, pp. 129–156.

Oprea, Alexandra. "Romani Feminism in Reactionary Times." *Signs* 38, no. 1, 2012, pp 11-21.

Matache, Margareta: Word, Image and Thought: Creating the Romani Other / The Legacy of Gypsy Studies in Modern Romani Scholarship / Dear Gadjo (non-Romani) Scholars... *The Huffington Post*, 2016-2017.

Möschel, Mathias. “Color Blindness or Total Blindness? The Absence of Critical Race Theory in Europe.” *Rutgers Race and the Law Review*; Newark 9 (1), 2007. pp. 57–128.

Said, Edward W: “Imaginative Geography and Its Representations: Orientalizing the Oriental” in: *Orientalism*, New York: Vintage Books, 1979, 49-72.

Schultz, Debra L. “Translating Intersectionality Theory into Practice: A Tale of Romani-Gadze Feminist Alliance.” *Signs*, 38 (1), 2012, pp 37–43.

Selling, Jan “Assessing the Historical Irresponsibility of the Gypsy Lore Society in Light of Romani Subaltern Challenges”, *Critical Romani Studies*, 1(1), 2018. pp. 44-61.

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty: “Can the Subaltern Speak?” in : Williams, R. J. Patrick, and Laura Chrisman (eds.) *Colonial Discourse and Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader*. New York : Columbia University Press, 1994.

Themelis, Spyros “The Time of the Roma in Times of Crisis: Where has European Neoliberal Capitalism Failed?” *Ethnicities*. 16(3), 2016, pp. 432-451.

Trehan, Nidhi, and Angéla Kóczé. "Racism, (neo-)colonialism and Social Justice: The Struggle for the Soul of the Romani Movement in Post-socialist Europe." In *Racism Postcolonialism Europe*, edited by Huggan Graham and Law Ian, 50-74. Liverpool University Press, 2009, pp 50-74.

Vincze, Enikő. “The Racialization of Roma in the ‘new’ Europe and the Political Potential of Romani Women” *European Journal of Women’s Studies* 21 (4), 2014, pp. 435–42.